

August 6, 2019

Report To: Travis Rob, Manager of O&F

From: Adam Mitchell, Asset Management Coordinator

RE: Award of RFP 19-OF-08 – Design Work for Roof Feasibility Study at the Memorial Sports Centre

The Fort Frances Memorial Sports Centre is a building that consists of a multiple type roof structure with a large variance in installation dates. There are several areas where roof leakage has been happening for a prolonged period and the severity of damage to the roof structure is unknown. The first step in addressing the leaks and the overall roof condition was to put together a request for proposals looking for a firm to complete the design works. The Proposal requested that an architect firm complete a detailed roof investigation and complete the design works for a refurbished roof structure along with all supporting documents required to tender this as a construction project in the future. Firms were to specifically address leaking areas in their designs and address opportunities for remedial work required to the underlying structure. Firms must consider the areas where leakage has been occurring for a while and address not only the roof membrane but any underlying insulation or structure issues and suggest remedial works where it is determined that ice damming has caused the leakage.

On July 18th, 2019 an RFP for a firm was released. Copies were sent to job boards in Thunder Bay and Winnipeg electronically as well as from the Town website. On August 6, 2019 the submitted proposals were opened publically at the Town of Fort Frances Civic Centre where four firms submitted proposals.

Proposals were received from JML Engineering of Thunder Bay Ontario, WSP of Winnipeg Manitoba, DST of Kenora Ontario and Pretium of Newmarket Ontario. Following receipt of the proposals, a review of the documents was conducted. A scoring matrix was utilized where the proposals were rated on 5 categories and weighting applied to each was used to judge the proposals. The categories were: quality of proposal, 30% weight, past experience, 30% weight, key personnel, 10% weight, cost, 20% weight, and schedule, 10% weight. Through this process, one proposal came out as a clear number 1. JML Engineering was rated number 1 with WSP rated as number 2 just ahead of Pretium at number 3. DST did not align with the scope of the RFP and their proposal did not score well because of that. The below table is the summary of the weighted scores from after a full review of the four proposals.

Firm	Score	Cost
JML Engineering	80.5	\$ 43,578.00
WSP	72.0	\$ 42,149.00
DST	46.0	\$ 86,130.00
Pretium	70.5	\$ 20,400.00

JML has proposed to complete all proposed work by October 31st well ahead of our suggested completion date. JML provided a cost of \$43,578.00 to complete a thorough site investigation including core samples of the roof, pre-design report, design drawings and issued tender documents. WSP, who scored much lower on the scoring matrix provided a cost of \$42,149 however their completion date was not till December 20th and provided much less detail about their investigation procedures. In addition, core samples were included as an extra in their proposal.

I recommend that the contract for the design of a new roof structure for the Memorial Sports Centre be awarded to JML Engineering.

Respectfully Submitted

A handwritten signature in blue ink, appearing to read 'Adam Mitchell', is positioned above the printed name.

Adam Mitchell

Asset Management Coordinator