

May 4, 2018

355616 GC
FF 2018 Road Reconstr.

Town of Fort Frances
320 Portage Avenue
Fort Frances, ON P9A 3P9

Attention: Mr. Travis Rob, P. Eng.
Manager, Operations and Facilities

Subject: Tender No. 18-OF-03
Mill Road Bridge Overpass Rehabilitation and
2018 Road Reconstruction, Watermain and Sewer Improvements
Recommendation for Award

Tenders for the above Contract were received by the Town of Fort Frances on May 1st, 2018. Three tenders were received as listed below in ascending order:

- | | | |
|----|--|------------------|
| 1) | 1876118 Ontario Limited O/A Makkinga Contracting & Equipment Rentals | - \$3,406,305.90 |
| 2) | Bay City Contractors (Thunder Bay) Inc. | - \$3,425,924.96 |
| 3) | Tom Veert Contracting Ltd. | - \$3,532,350.61 |

The Engineer's estimate for this project was \$3,432,711.74. All prices include 13% HST and a \$150,000 contingency allowance for any unforeseen items that may be encountered during construction. The contingency allowance will not be spent without prior written approval from the Town of Fort Frances. No arithmetic errors were found in any of the submitted tenders. A copy of the tender comparison spreadsheet for all the submitted bids as well as Hatch's estimate is attached.

GENERAL REVIEW

A general review was conducted on all of the received tenders. All were signed and accompanied by the requisite bonding, OH&S declaration, and all tenderers acknowledged receiving the four Addenda issued during the tendering period. There did not appear to be any un-balanced tender items between the lowest and second lowest tenders.

The low bidder, Makkinga Contracting & Equipment Rentals, is an experienced road and sewer contractor and has completed sizeable sewer, watermain, and road construction projects in both Rainy River and Fort Frances in the recent past.

TENDERING STATEMENTS "A" TO "F"

A review of the two lowest tenderers submission of Statements "A" to "F" was completed. Bay City Contractors submitted all the required statements, namely, the List of Similar Work, Supervisory Staff, Construction Equipment, Sub-Contractors and Suppliers, Sources of Granular Materials, Concrete, and Asphalt. There were no alternative products proposed from either Bay City Contractors or Makkinga Contracting in Schedule "F".

Makkinga Contracting has named both Mr. John Makkinga and Mr. Andrew Makkinga Superintendents for this project. Andrew has over 10 years' experience and John over 35 years as listed on Statement "B". Makkinga Contracting failed to complete Statement "C" – Tenderer's Construction Equipment. A list of equipment was previously provided by Makkinga Contracting and found to be satisfactory.

Both Statements "D" Subcontractors and Suppliers and Statement "E" Sources of Granular Materials, Concrete, and Asphalt were not fully completed by Makkinga Contracting.

The uncompleted statements were discussed with Makkinga Contracting and they have informed me that the following Subcontractors and Suppliers will be used.

STATEMENT "D" – SUB-CONTRACTORS AND SUPPLIERS

<u>Sub-Trade Section or Equipment</u>	<u>Name and Address of Sub-Contractor or Supplier</u>
Structural Contractor (Bridge Rehabilitation)	Vector Construction – Thunder Bay
Wabocrete Strip Seals and Expansion Joints	Vector Construction – Thunder Bay
Watermain Installation (Directional Drill)	LTL Directional Drilling – Thunder Bay
Sewer and Watermain Installation (Open Cut)	None
Earth Excavating (Grading)	None
Granular "B" Placement	None
Granular "A" Placement	None
HL4 Asphalt and Superpave	Pioneer Construction - Kenora
Concrete Works (Curb & Gutter, and Sidewalk)	Arella – Thunder Bay
Landscaping	Daryl's/Staal/Makkinga
Electrical (Portable Temporary Traffic Signals)	Barricade Traffic Services Inc.

NOTE: Indicate "N/A" or "None" if you intend on performing all aspects of this Work.

STATEMENT "E" – SOURCES OF GRANULAR MATERIALS, CONCRETE AND ASPHALT

<u>Material</u>	<u>Supplier</u>	<u>Supplier's Pit Location</u>
Asphalt	Pioneer Construction	Kenora
Granular "A"	Veert	Fort Frances
Granular "B", Type I and II	Veert	Fort Frances
Concrete	N/A Whitherspoon	Devlin

All of the listed sub-contractors and suppliers have extensive experience in the related fields and should adequately complete their related works on this contract. Makkinga Contracting has verbally informed Hatch that it is their intention to utilize Tera North for the Bridge Deck Waterproofing. Any change in the listed suppliers or sub-contractors must be made in writing by Makkinga Contracting and approved by the Town of Fort Frances and the Contract Administrator.

CONTRACT VALUE

The tender contained provisional items and clauses which allow the Town of Fort Frances to delete certain tender items prior to and during construction if so required. In discussions with the Town Manager of Operations and Facilities the following tender items will be deleted or reduced as follows:

1. Delete Item E.005 Twin 100 mm Dia. PVC Storm Services (Contract Reduction of \$16,000)
2. Reduce Item F.004 Hydrant Replacements from 6 to 4 (Contract Reduction of \$29,000)
3. Reduce Item F.005 Valve Replacements from 5 to 4 (Contract Reduction of \$6,500)

With the above reductions totaling \$51,500.00 the revised contract price would be \$2,962,930.00 exclusive of HST or \$3,348,110.90 including 13% HST.

RECOMMENDATION

Based upon the tender prices received the Town of Fort Frances should award the contract to **1876118 Ontario Limited O/A Makkinga Contracting & Equipment Rentals** in the amount of **\$3,348,110.90** which includes 13% HST and a \$150,000 Contingency Allowance.

All of which is respectfully submitted for your consideration.

Yours truly,



Rob Marasco

RM:ks

Encl.