

September 27, 2018

Report To: Travis Rob, Manager of Operations and Facilities

From: Milt Strachan, Transportation Superintendent

Subject: Tender No. 18-OF-08 Heavy Duty Tandem Drive Articulated Motor Grader with Snow Wing Assembly

There were a total of four (4) tenders received. I will briefly explain deficiencies if any for all four (4) tenders.

- 1.) NORTRAX CANADA INC.
Make: John Deere
Model: 670G

The John Deere 670G Grader meets or exceeds all of the specifications in the Tender.

- 2.) NORTRAX CANADA INC.
Make: John Deere
Model: 770G

The John Deere 770G Grader meets or exceeds all of the specifications in the Tender.

- 3.) TOROMONT CAT
Make: Caterpillar
Model: 140

The Caterpillar 140 Grader meets or exceeds all of the specifications in the Tender.

- 4.) TOROMONT CAT
Make: Caterpillar
Model: 160K

The Caterpillar 160K Grader is a 2017 Model and the Tender calls for a 2018 Model, so is therefore disqualified.

Summary:

There are three (3) Graders that meet the specifications in the Tender, The John Deere Models 670G and 770G as well as the Caterpillar Model 140.

The Caterpillar 140 is the low bid price at a Net Cost to the Town of \$284,928.00 This is \$15072.00 under the amount that was budgeted and is \$52,560.75 lower than the next lowest bid price.

It is my recommendation that the Town of Fort Frances purchases the 2018 Caterpillar 140 from TOROMONT CAT.

A handwritten signature in blue ink, appearing to read "Milt Strachan". The signature is fluid and cursive, with the first name "Milt" and last name "Strachan" clearly distinguishable.

Milt Strachan
Transportation Superintendent

**Spreadsheet #1 - Tender No. 18-OF-08 - Results - New Heavy Duty Tandem Drive Articulated
Motor Grader with Snow Wing Assembly
September 27, 2018**

Equipment Description	A		B		C		D	
	NORTRAX Equipment	2018	NORTRAX Equipment	2018	TOROMONT Cat	2018	TOROMONT Cat	2017
Manufacturer	John Deere	2018	John Deere	2018	Caterpillar	2018	Caterpillar	2017
Model	670G	770G	770G	140	140	160K	160K	

New Grader with Snow Wing Assembly	\$371,463.00	\$373,963.00	\$325,000.00	\$298,500.00
Trade in of 1999 Champion Model 720A	(\$25,000.00)	(\$25,000.00)	(\$45,000.00)	(\$45,000.00)
Subtotal	\$346,463.00	\$348,963.00	\$280,000.00	\$253,500.00
HST	\$45,040.19	\$45,365.19	\$36,400.00	\$32,955.00
Total Price (includes all taxes)	\$391,503.19	\$394,328.19	\$316,400.00	\$286,455.00

Net Cost to the Town for New Grader	\$352,560.75	\$355,104.75	\$284,928.00	\$257,961.60
2018 Budgeted Amount	\$300,000.00	\$300,000.00	\$300,000.00	\$300,000.00
Over/ <u>Under</u> Budget By	\$52,560.75	\$55,104.75	(\$15,072.00)	(\$42,038.40)
Difference from Low bidder	\$67,632.75	\$70,176.75	\$0.00	does not meet spec
Delivery Date from date of Purchase Order	120 days	120 days	160 days	90 days