

Spreadsheet No. 1 - February of 2019 - RFP No. 18-AF -14 Land Use/Economic Development Feasibility Study for the Shevlin Wood Yard/ old Nursing Station Properties

	1	2	3	4	5	6	7	
	Evaluation Parameters	Stantec	Brook McIlroy	HTFC	Scatliff+Miller+Murray	ft3	Urban Systems	Re: Public
1	Number of Project Team Members	10	13	7	9	5	5	6
2	Project Lead	Paula Sdao	Calvin Brook/Katie Black	Glen Manning	Tom Janzen	Jerald D Peters	Andrew Baigent	Paul Hicks
3	subcontractors/Associates	Explorer Solutions (ED)	Golder Associates, TBT Engineering, Bain Smith consulting (ED& Financial), AW Hooker Associate	Catapult Community Planning (ED), CSB Management (Real Estate management), Saulteaux Engineering	MDB Insight (ED) & The Planning Partnership	Landmark Planning & Design Inc. McClure (ED)	none	Colliers Project leaders (real estate) Doyletech (ED)
4	Total numbers of hours	765	958	963	922	713	434	779
5	Total fees	\$102,555.00	\$136,313.00	\$119,370.00	\$139,286.00	\$155,500.00	\$71,000.00	118950
6	Disbursements	\$15,220.00	\$11,000.00	\$9,500.00	\$8,000.00	\$29,500.00	\$6,850.00	12650
7	Subtotal Cost	\$117,775.00	\$147,313.00	\$128,870.00	\$147,286.00	\$185,000.00	\$77,850.00	\$131,600.00
8	HST	\$15,310.75	\$19,150.69	\$16,753.10	\$19,147.18	\$24,050.00	\$10,120.50	\$17,108.00
9	Total Cost	\$133,085.75	\$166,463.69	\$145,623.10	\$166,433.18	\$209,050.00	\$87,970.50	\$148,708.00
10	Net cost to Town	\$119,847.84	\$149,905.71	\$131,138.11	\$149,878.23	\$188,256.00	\$79,220.16	\$133,916.16
11	Cost per hour	\$156.66	\$156.48	\$136.18	\$162.56	\$264.03	\$182.53	\$171.91
12	Range of Hourly Rates	\$ 75.00 to \$190	\$90 to \$ 230	\$100 to \$ 200	\$ 95 to \$233	\$200 to \$ 300	???	\$125 to \$ 200
13	Duration of Project	5.5 months or 22 weeks	7 months	6 months	9 months	6 months	5 months	6 months
14	Trips to Fort Frances	4	2	6	3	4	3	3
15	Firm Location	Thunder Bay	Thunder Bay	Winnipeg	Winnipeg	Winnipeg	Winnipeg	Montreal
16	Notes	Public Consultation with the Youth, Couchiching Community Business Stakeholders, Real and Measurable ED solutions	Thunder Bay - Prince Arthur Landing Master Plan & Implementation, WaterGarden Pavilion - Thunder Bay, Delta Waterfront Hotel -Thunder Bay Thunder Bay Age friendly Action Plan (Senior housing needs) Public Consultation with Couchiching Dawn Powell Real Estate expert with Bain Smith, Proposed Adjustments to Cost estimates (C to D)	4 phase approach wants a core owner team- steering committee " The Spirit of the Place" concept, The Core Owner Team, Broader Stakeholder engagement - FFCC& BIA Why??? First Nation Inclusion- Kenora - Downtown Renewal Plan and Kenora Harbourfront Business Development Plan, Dryden Waterfront Revitalization Plan Sioux Lookout Wellington Avenue & Beach Revitalization	7 Pillars approach- Community Based Marketing & ED Strategic planning concept - Rainy Lake Market Square design & Project Management- Kenora - 2010 - Beaches, Parks +Trails Yellowknife Habour Plan	22 Tasks to complete Study - Sioux Lookout Hostel, Red Lake Fire Management Headquarters	Boundless Aspirations - sound & reliable market research- Rainy River First Nations	First Nation Consultation- Red lake & Kenora - Official Plan & zoning by-laws Review
	Proposal Quality: 30%	1	4	2	3			
	Past Experience: 45%	2	4	4	4			
	Key Personnel: 10%	1	4	4	4			
	Proposal Cost: 10%	2	3	4	1			
	Schedule:5%	4	2	3	1			
	Total Score	10	17	17	13			
		250	425	425	325			