

April 6, 2022

364258-P

Town of Fort Frances  
320 Portage Avenue  
Fort Frances, Ontario  
P9A 3P9

**Attention: Travis Rob, P.Eng.**

**Re: 2022 Road Reconstruction  
Mowat Avenue Reconstruction  
Tender No.22-OF-06  
Tender Recommendation**

---

Tenders for the above project were received by the Town of Fort Frances on or before 2:00 pm (CDT) on Wednesday, April 5<sup>th</sup>, 2022. Four (4) tenders were received, and are listed below in ascending order:

| <u>Tenderer</u>                                   | <u>Tender Price</u> |
|---|---------------------|
| 1) Bay City Contractors Thunder Bay Inc. (BCC)    | \$2,098,981.78      |
| 2) Makkinga Contractors & Equipment Rental (MCER) | \$2,309,361.79      |
| 3) George Armstrong Co. Limited (GACL)            | \$2,578,688.25      |
| 4) Tom Veert Contracting Limited (TVCL)           | \$2,742,275.98      |

The above tender prices include H.S.T. The Tenders were checked arithmetically and were all found to be correct.

### **TENDER IRREGULARITIES**

A review of the tenders was undertaken. All of the four (4) tenderers submitted a Bid Bond in the amount of 10% of the Tender Price and an Agreement to Bond and/or Consent of Surety. All tenderers included completed Forms A, B, C, D, E and F of the Tender documents.

### **REVIEW OF TENDER PRICES**

A review of the tender prices submitted by the tenderers was undertaken. BCC's tender pricing was generally overall lower than the other tenderers.

Removal items and temporary water and sanitary items accounted for a significant difference from the second lowest bidder. There are no items noted in our review that seem to be overlooked or missed. Furthermore, the low tenderer has indicated they are comfortable with the price submitted.

## **LOW TENDERER'S QUALIFICATIONS**

BCC is a reputable and experienced road, watermain and sewer contractor. They have completed numerous similar scope of work projects in the Rainy River, Fort Frances and Sioux Lookout in the recent past (reference the Tendering Supplements, Form A, Tenderer's Experience in Similar Work for a detailed summary of recent similar projects).

BCC is proposing to carry out the majority of the work with their own forces which includes all the excavation, grading and pipe works. BCC has stated that all asphalt works will be completed by Pioneer Construction, and concrete works will be completed by NST Construction.

## **PROPOSED PROJECT SCHEDULE**

This Contract includes a completion date of October 28, 2022. BCC has indicated that they intend on starting construction mid-June. BCC stated that they will have dedicated crews working onsite throughout the Contract and do not anticipate any issues meeting the specified completion date of October 28, 2022.

## **RECOMMENDATION**

We recommend that the Contract be awarded to Bay City Contractors.

With this report we are enclosing a spreadsheet showing a comparison of the tender prices and the engineer's estimate.

Yours very truly,



Joseph De Luca, P. Eng.  
Senior Project Engineer  
Encl.

|  |             |   |          |       | Engineer's Estimate |                 | Bay City Contractors (Thunder Bay) |                 | Makkinga Contractors (1876118) |                 | George Armstrong Company Ltd. |                 | Tom Veert Contracting Limited |                 |
|--|-------------|---|----------|-------|---------------------|-----------------|------------------------------------|-----------------|--------------------------------|-----------------|-------------------------------|-----------------|-------------------------------|-----------------|
| ITEM NO.   | OPS SPEC.   | DESCRIPTION   | EST. QTY | UNIT  | UNIT BID PRICE      | TOTAL BID PRICE | UNIT BID PRICE                     | TOTAL BID PRICE | UNIT BID PRICE                 | TOTAL BID PRICE | UNIT BID PRICE                | TOTAL BID PRICE | UNIT BID PRICE                | TOTAL BID PRICE |
| PART 1 - MOWAT AVENUE (From Sta 1+000 To Sta 1+200) - DWG A1-364258-P16) |             |   |          |       |                     |                 |                                    |                 |                                |                 |                               |                 |                               |                 |
| SECTION A - GRADING  |             |   |          |       |                     |                 |                                    |                 |                                |                 |                               |                 |                               |                 |
| A.001  | 206, SP     | Earth Excavation (Grading)  | 1,705    | m³(P) | \$ 20.00            | \$ 34,100.00    | \$ 21.00                           | \$ 35,805.00    | \$ 15.00                       | \$ 25,575.00    | \$ 15.00                      | \$ 25,575.00    | \$ 17.70                      | \$ 30,178.50    |
| A.002  | 310, SP     | Hot Mix HL4 Asphalt (Binder Course 60mm)                                      | 360      | t     | \$ 265.00           | \$ 95,400.00    | \$ 305.00                          | \$ 109,800.00   | \$ 317.00                      | \$ 114,120.00   | \$ 306.00                     | \$ 110,160.00   | \$ 448.22                     | \$ 161,359.20   |
| A.003  | 310, SP     | Hot Mix HL4 Asphalt (Surface Course 60mm)                                     | 360      | t     | \$ 255.00           | \$ 91,800.00    | \$ 300.00                          | \$ 108,000.00   | \$ 281.00                      | \$ 101,160.00   | \$ 282.00                     | \$ 101,520.00   | \$ 412.04                     | \$ 148,334.40   |
| A.004  | 314, SP     | Granular 'A' (150mm Depth)  | 885      | t     | \$ 30.00            | \$ 26,550.00    | \$ 35.00                           | \$ 30,975.00    | \$ 27.00                       | \$ 23,895.00    | \$ 35.00                      | \$ 30,975.00    | \$ 38.28                      | \$ 33,877.80    |
| A.005  | 314, SP     | Granular 'B' (Type II) (600mm Depth)  | 3,285    | t     | \$ 30.00            | \$ 98,550.00    | \$ 30.00                           | \$ 98,550.00    | \$ 27.00                       | \$ 88,695.00    | \$ 27.00                      | \$ 88,695.00    | \$ 32.80                      | \$ 107,748.00   |
| A.006  | 510, SP     | Removal of Asphalt Pavement (Full Depth)                                      | 2,510    | m²(P) | \$ 6.00             | \$ 15,060.00    | \$ 6.00                            | \$ 15,060.00    | \$ 6.00                        | \$ 15,060.00    | \$ 7.00                       | \$ 17,570.00    | \$ 8.84                       | \$ 22,188.40    |
| A.007  | 510, SP     | Removal of Curb and Gutter  | 337      | m(P)  | \$ 25.00            | \$ 8,425.00     | \$ 15.00                           | \$ 5,055.00     | \$ 21.00                       | \$ 7,077.00     | \$ 15.00                      | \$ 5,055.00     | \$ 8.20                       | \$ 2,763.40     |
| A.008  | 353, SP     | Curb and Gutter   | 337      | m     | \$ 225.00           | \$ 75,825.00    | \$ 250.00                          | \$ 84,250.00    | \$ 279.00                      | \$ 94,023.00    | \$ 250.00                     | \$ 84,250.00    | \$ 336.94                     | \$ 113,548.78   |
| A.009  | 510, SP     | Remove Concrete Driveway  | 72       | m²    | \$ 25.00            | \$ 1,800.00     | \$ 30.00                           | \$ 2,160.00     | \$ 45.00                       | \$ 3,240.00     | \$ 25.00                      | \$ 1,800.00     | \$ 46.08                      | \$ 3,317.76     |
| A.010  | 510, SP     | Remove Concrete Sidewalk  | 151      | m²    | \$ 25.00            | \$ 3,775.00     | \$ 30.00                           | \$ 4,530.00     | \$ 45.00                       | \$ 6,795.00     | \$ 35.00                      | \$ 5,285.00     | \$ 12.81                      | \$ 1,934.31     |
| A.011  | 510, SP     | Remove Paving Stone Sidewalk  | 860      | m²    | \$ 25.00            | \$ 21,500.00    | \$ 10.00                           | \$ 8,600.00     | \$ 25.00                       | \$ 21,500.00    | \$ 35.00                      | \$ 30,100.00    | \$ 7.71                       | \$ 6,630.60     |
| A.012  | 351, SP     | Concrete Driveway Aprons  | 165      | m²    | \$ 250.00           | \$ 41,250.00    | \$ 180.00                          | \$ 29,700.00    | \$ 185.00                      | \$ 30,525.00    | \$ 180.00                     | \$ 29,700.00    | \$ 340.07                     | \$ 56,111.55    |
| A.013  | 310, SP     | Concrete Sidewalk   | 955      | m²    | \$ 250.00           | \$ 238,750.00   | \$ 200.00                          | \$ 191,000.00   | \$ 202.00                      | \$ 192,910.00   | \$ 185.00                     | \$ 176,675.00   | \$ 263.38                     | \$ 251,527.90   |
| A.014  | 710         | Pavement Markings   | 1        | LS    | \$ 15,000.00        | \$ 15,000.00    | \$ 22,000.00                       | \$ 22,000.00    | \$ 21,000.00                   | \$ 21,000.00    | \$ 13,000.00                  | \$ 13,000.00    | \$ 33,694.04                  | \$ 33,694.04    |
| A.015  | 510         | Removal of Concrete Subbase   | 200      | m3    | \$ 50.00            | \$ 10,000.00    | \$ 50.00                           | \$ 10,000.00    | \$ 60.00                       | \$ 12,000.00    | \$ 20.00                      | \$ 4,000.00     | \$ 71.02                      | \$ 14,204.00    |
| Total Section A - Grading  |             |   |          |       |                     | \$ 777,785.00   |                                    | \$ 755,485.00   |                                | \$ 757,575.00   |                               | \$ 724,360.00   |                               | \$ 987,418.64   |
| SECTION B - STORM SEWERS   |             |   |          |       |                     |                 |                                    |                 |                                |                 |                               |                 |                               |                 |
| B.001  | 510, SP     | Remove Existing Catchbasins and Manholes                                      | 6        | ea    | \$ 1,000.00         | \$ 6,000.00     | \$ 750.00                          | \$ 4,500.00     | \$ 1,200.00                    | \$ 7,200.00     | \$ 2,500.00                   | \$ 15,000.00    | \$ 2,263.00                   | \$ 13,578.00    |
| B.002  | 510, SP     | Remove Existing Catchbasin Leads  | 13       | m     | \$ 20.00            | \$ 260.00       | \$ 40.00                           | \$ 520.00       | \$ 35.00                       | \$ 455.00       | \$ 50.00                      | \$ 650.00       | \$ 74.55                      | \$ 969.15       |
| B.003  | 510, SP     | Remove Existing 750 mm Storm Sewer  | 93       | m     | \$ 25.00            | \$ 2,325.00     | \$ 50.00                           | \$ 4,650.00     | \$ 45.00                       | \$ 4,185.00     | \$ 50.00                      | \$ 4,650.00     | \$ 149.27                     | \$ 13,882.11    |
| B.004  | 510, SP     | Remove Existing 600 mm Storm Sewer  | 80       | m     | \$ 25.00            | \$ 2,000.00     | \$ 50.00                           | \$ 4,000.00     | \$ 45.00                       | \$ 3,600.00     | \$ 50.00                      | \$ 4,000.00     | \$ 102.37                     | \$ 8,189.60     |
| B.005  | 510, SP     | Remove Existing 450 mm Storm Sewer  | 43       | m     | \$ 25.00            | \$ 1,075.00     | \$ 40.00                           | \$ 1,720.00     | \$ 40.00                       | \$ 1,720.00     | \$ 50.00                      | \$ 2,150.00     | \$ 314.08                     | \$ 13,505.44    |
| B.006  | 510, SP     | Remove Existing 300 mm Storm Sewer  | 7        | m     | \$ 25.00            | \$ 175.00       | \$ 40.00                           | \$ 280.00       | \$ 40.00                       | \$ 280.00       | \$ 50.00                      | \$ 350.00       | \$ 829.98                     | \$ 5,809.86     |
| B.007  | 510, SP     | Reconnect Storm Sewer Various Sizes   | 6        | ea    | \$ 1,500.00         | \$ 9,000.00     | \$ 750.00                          | \$ 4,500.00     | \$ 2,000.00                    | \$ 12,000.00    | \$ 2,500.00                   | \$ 15,000.00    | \$ 2,219.63                   | \$ 13,317.78    |
| B.008  | 407, SP     | Catchbasins   | 4        | ea    | \$ 5,000.00         | \$ 20,000.00    | \$ 5,200.00                        | \$ 20,800.00    | \$ 4,500.00                    | \$ 18,000.00    | \$ 10,500.00                  | \$ 42,000.00    | \$ 8,384.31                   | \$ 33,537.24    |
| B.009  | 407, SP     | Storm Manholes  | 2        | ea    | \$ 15,000.00        | \$ 30,000.00    | \$ 12,000.00                       | \$ 24,000.00    | \$ 13,935.00                   | \$ 27,870.00    | \$ 15,000.00                  | \$ 30,000.00    | \$ 16,390.59                  | \$ 32,781.18    |
| B.010  | 410         | Catchbasin Leads 250 mm (PVC SDR 35)  | 25       | m     | \$ 300.00           | \$ 7,500.00     | \$ 300.00                          | \$ 7,500.00     | \$ 339.00                      | \$ 8,475.00     | \$ 350.00                     | \$ 8,750.00     | \$ 354.64                     | \$ 8,866.00     |
| B.011  | 410         | 750 mm Storm Sewer  | 93       | m     | \$ 1,350.00         | \$ 125,550.00   | \$ 1,000.00                        | \$ 93,000.00    | \$ 905.00                      | \$ 84,165.00    | \$ 1,000.00                   | \$ 93,000.00    | \$ 1,453.55                   | \$ 135,180.15   |
| B.012  | 410         | 600 mm Storm Sewer  | 80       | m     | \$ 1,100.00         | \$ 88,000.00    | \$ 750.00                          | \$ 60,000.00    | \$ 717.00                      | \$ 57,360.00    | \$ 980.00                     | \$ 78,400.00    | \$ 930.78                     | \$ 74,462.40    |
| B.013  | 410         | 450 mm Storm Sewer  | 43       | m     | \$ 900.00           | \$ 38,700.00    | \$ 600.00                          | \$ 25,800.00    | \$ 516.00                      | \$ 22,188.00    | \$ 850.00                     | \$ 36,550.00    | \$ 735.56                     | \$ 31,629.08    |
| B.014  | 410         | 300 mm Storm Sewer  | 7        | m     | \$ 450.00           | \$ 3,150.00     | \$ 450.00                          | \$ 3,150.00     | \$ 405.00                      | \$ 2,835.00     | \$ 570.00                     | \$ 3,990.00     | \$ 730.18                     | \$ 5,111.26     |
| B.015  | 405         | Subdrain  | 350      | m     | \$ 100.00           | \$ 35,000.00    | \$ 100.00                          | \$ 35,000.00    | \$ 80.00                       | \$ 28,000.00    | \$ 160.00                     | \$ 56,000.00    | \$ 50.41                      | \$ 17,643.50    |
| Total Section B - Storm Sewers   |             |   |          |       |                     | \$ 368,735.00   |                                    | \$ 289,420.00   |                                | \$ 278,333.00   |                               | \$ 390,490.00   |                               | \$ 408,462.75   |
| SECTION C - WATERMAIN  |             |   |          |       |                     |                 |                                    |                 |                                |                 |                               |                 |                               |                 |
| C.001  | 510,441, SP | Remove and Replace Ex. 150 WM w 150 PVC WM                                    | 129      | m     | \$ 750.00           | \$ 96,750.00    | \$ 575.00                          | \$ 74,175.00    | \$ 505.00                      | \$ 65,145.00    | \$ 870.00                     | \$ 112,230.00   | \$ 672.53                     | \$ 86,756.37    |
| C.002  | 441, SP     | 150 mm Water Valve and Box  | 2        | ea    | \$ 5,000.00         | \$ 10,000.00    | \$ 4,250.00                        | \$ 8,500.00     | \$ 3,920.00                    | \$ 7,840.00     | \$ 4,800.00                   | \$ 9,600.00     | \$ 5,480.96                   | \$ 10,961.92    |
| C.003  | 441, SP     | 150 mm x 150mm x 150mm Tee  | 1        | ea    | \$ 2,000.00         | \$ 2,000.00     | \$ 2,000.00                        | \$ 2,000.00     | \$ 3,360.00                    | \$ 3,360.00     | \$ 3,500.00                   | \$ 3,500.00     | \$ 1,820.56                   | \$ 1,820.56     |
| C.004  | 441, SP     | Connect to Existing Watermain   | 3        | ea    | \$ 2,000.00         | \$ 6,000.00     | \$ 3,500.00                        | \$ 10,500.00    | \$ 4,120.00                    | \$ 12,360.00    | \$ 4,500.00                   | \$ 13,500.00    | \$ 3,757.09                   | \$ 11,271.27    |
| C.005  | 441, SP     | Remove and Replace Hydrant Set  | 1        | ea    | \$ 20,000.00        | \$ 20,000.00    | \$ 15,000.00                       | \$ 15,000.00    | \$ 17,590.00                   | \$ 17,590.00    | \$ 22,000.00                  | \$ 22,000.00    | \$ 25,789.56                  | \$ 25,789.56    |
| C.006  | 441, SP     | Remove and Replace 19 mm Copper Water Service and Curb Stops to Property Line | 8        | ea    | \$ 4,000.00         | \$ 32,000.00    | \$ 4,000.00                        | \$ 32,000.00    | \$ 6,145.00                    | \$ 49,160.00    | \$ 14,000.00                  | \$ 112,000.00   | \$ 3,635.46                   | \$ 29,083.68    |
| C.007  | 441, SP     | Temporary Water Service   | 1        | LS    | \$ 10,000.00        | \$ 10,000.00    | \$ 10,000.00                       | \$ 10,000.00    | \$ 17,500.00                   | \$ 17,500.00    | \$ 25,000.00                  | \$ 25,000.00    | \$ 46,345.31                  | \$ 46,345.31    |
| Total Section C - Watermain  |             |   |          |       |                     | \$ 176,750.00   |                                    | \$ 152,175.00   |                                | \$ 172,955.00   |                               | \$ 297,830.00   |                               | \$ 212,028.67   |
| SECTION D - SANITARY   |             |   |          |       |                     |                 |                                    |                 |                                |                 |                               |                 |                               |                 |
| D.001  | 510, SP     | Remove Existing Sanitary Sewer  | 126      | m     | \$ 50.00            | \$ 6,300.00     | \$ 50.00                           | \$ 6,300.00     | \$ 40.00                       | \$ 5,040.00     | \$ 50.00                      | \$ 6,300.00     | \$ 254.74                     | \$ 32,097.24    |
| D.002  | 410, SP     | 500 mm PVC SDR Sanitary Sewer   | 15       | m     | \$ 1,500.00         | \$ 22,500.00    | \$ 1,750.00                        | \$ 26,250.00    | \$ 2,130.00                    | \$ 31,950.00    | \$ 955.00                     | \$ 14,325.00    | \$ 1,206.96                   | \$ 18,104.40    |
| D.002  | 410, SP     | 450 mm PVC SDR Sanitary Sewer   | 98       | m     | \$ 1,000.00         | \$ 98,000.00    | \$ 800.00                          | \$ 78,400.00    | \$ 880.00                      | \$ 86,240.00    | \$ 850.00                     | \$ 83,300.00    | \$ 970.81                     | \$ 95,139.38    |
| D.002  | 410, SP     | 375 mm PVC SDR Sanitary Sewer   | 13       | m     | \$ 900.00           | \$ 11,700.00    | \$ 770.00                          | \$ 10,010.00    | \$ 2,060.00                    | \$ 26,780.00    | \$ 800.00                     | \$ 10,400.00    | \$ 933.03                     | \$ 12,129.39    |
| D.003  | 410, SP     | Remove and Replace Existing 150 mm Sanitary Services                          | 14       | ea    | \$ 3,000.00         | \$ 42,000.00    | \$ 3,500.00                        | \$ 49,000.00    | \$ 6,500.00                    | \$ 91,000.00    | \$ 10,500.00                  | \$ 147,000.00   | \$ 4,207.16                   | \$ 58,900.24    |
| D.004  | 407, SP     | Sanitary Manholes   | 1        | ea    | \$ 15,000.00        | \$ 15,000.00    | \$ 17,000.00                       | \$ 17,000.00    | \$ 17,200.00                   | \$ 17,200.00    | \$ 20,000.00                  | \$ 20,000.00    | \$ 22,613.67                  | \$ 22,613.67    |
| D.005  | 410, SP     | Temporary Sewer Service   | 1        | LS    | \$ 10,000.00        | \$ 10,000.00    | \$ 2,500.00                        | \$ 2,500.00     | \$ 18,500.00                   | \$ 18,500.00    | \$ 20,000.00                  | \$ 20,000.00    | \$ 87,090.74                  | \$ 87,090.74    |
| D.006  | 409, SP     | CCTV Inspection of Sanitary Sewer Mainline                                    | 126      | m     | \$ 25.00            | \$ 3,150.00     | \$ 25.00                           | \$ 3,150.00     | \$ 45.00                       | \$ 5,670.00     | \$ 50.00                      | \$              |                               |                 |

| PART 3 - GENERAL ITEMS               |               |                               |     |    |               |                 |               |                 |               |                 |               |                 |               |                 |
|--------------------------------------|---------------|-------------------------------|-----|----|---------------|-----------------|---------------|-----------------|---------------|-----------------|---------------|-----------------|---------------|-----------------|
| G.001                                | SP            | Bonds & Insurance             | 1   | LS | \$ 75,000.00  | \$ 75,000.00    | \$ 30,000.00  | \$ 30,000.00    | \$ 23,000.00  | \$ 23,000.00    | \$ 80,000.00  | \$ 80,000.00    | \$ 40,448.54  | \$ 40,448.54    |
| G.002                                | SP            | Mobilization & Demobilization | 1   | LS | \$ 125,000.00 | \$ 125,000.00   | \$ 80,000.00  | \$ 80,000.00    | \$ 115,500.00 | \$ 115,500.00   | \$ 95,000.00  | \$ 95,000.00    | \$ 16,847.02  | \$ 16,847.02    |
| *G.003                               | SP            | Styrofoam Insulation (50mm)   | 120 | m2 | \$ 50.00      | \$ 6,000.00     | \$ 40.00      | \$ 4,800.00     | \$ 104.00     | \$ 12,480.00    | \$ 70.00      | \$ 8,400.00     | \$ 32.43      | \$ 3,891.60     |
| *G.004                               | Section 01000 | Consultant Site Office        | 1   | LS | \$ 75,000.00  | \$ 75,000.00    | \$ 5,000.00   | \$ 5,000.00     | \$ 5,200.00   | \$ 5,200.00     | \$ 3,500.00   | \$ 3,500.00     | \$ 7,581.16   | \$ 7,581.16     |
| G.005                                | SP            | Contingency Allowance         | 1   | LS | \$ 150,000.00 | \$ 150,000.00   | \$ 150,000.00 | \$ 150,000.00   | \$ 150,000.00 | \$ 150,000.00   | \$ 150,000.00 | \$ 150,000.00   | \$ 150,000.00 | \$ 150,000.00   |
| PART 3 - GENERAL ITEMS               |               |                               |     |    |               | \$ 431,000.00   |               | \$ 269,800.00   |               | \$ 306,180.00   |               | \$ 336,900.00   |               | \$ 218,768.32   |
| SUMMARY OF TENDER PRICES             |               |                               |     |    |               |                 |               |                 |               |                 |               |                 |               |                 |
| PART 1 - Mowat Avenue Reconstruction |               |                               |     |    |               | \$ 1,534,440.00 |               | \$ 1,391,706.00 |               | \$ 1,498,803.00 |               | \$ 1,729,125.00 |               | \$ 1,945,356.62 |
| PART 2 - Miscellaneous Waterworks    |               |                               |     |    |               | \$ 228,000.00   |               | \$ 196,000.00   |               | \$ 238,700.00   |               | \$ 216,000.00   |               | \$ 262,667.96   |
| PART 3 - General Items               |               |                               |     |    |               | \$ 431,000.00   |               | \$ 269,800.00   |               | \$ 306,180.00   |               | \$ 336,900.00   |               | \$ 218,768.32   |
| SUB-TOTAL                            |               |                               |     |    |               | \$ 2,193,440.00 |               | \$ 1,857,506.00 |               | \$ 2,043,683.00 |               | \$ 2,282,025.00 |               | \$ 2,426,792.90 |
| 13% HST                              |               |                               |     |    |               | \$ 285,147.20   |               | \$ 241,475.78   |               | \$ 265,678.79   |               | \$ 296,663.25   |               | \$ 315,483.08   |
| TOTAL TENDER PRICE                   |               |                               |     |    |               | \$ 2,478,587.20 |               | \$ 2,098,981.78 |               | \$ 2,309,361.79 |               | \$ 2,578,688.25 |               | \$ 2,742,275.98 |