

September 4, 2019

Report To: Travis Rob, Manager of O&F

From: Adam Mitchell, Asset Management Coordinator

RE: Award of RFP 19-OF-09 – Design Work for HVAC Upgrades at Museum and MSC

The Town of Fort Frances released an RFP on August 8th, 2019 looking to engage an engineering firm to complete HVAC design work at the Fort Frances Museum and Memorial Sports Centre. Copies were sent to job boards in Thunder Bay and Winnipeg electronically as well as posted to the Town's website. The Scope of the RFP is to:

1. Upgrade HVAC system at the Fort Frances Museum
2. Replacement of an aged AC unit on the roof of the Auditorium area of the 52 Canadians Arena
3. Addition of an HRV at the 52 Canadians Arena

The work is to include complete detailed design work including construction specifications, architectural, structural and related specifications for construction. Firms were told to utilize as much of the existing infrastructure as possible in order to minimize disturbance to the building and keep construction costs to a minimum.

On August 23rd, 2019 a mandatory site meet was scheduled which saw the participation of 6 firms from across the region. Both locations were visited and extensive tours of both facilities were completed allowing us to effectively communicate our scope of work to the firms and eliminate any chance of interpretation regarding our RFP.

On September 3rd, 2019, proposals were received and opened publicly at the Town of Fort Frances Civic Centre from the following 6 firms;

Firm	Score	Cost
RVI Group	63.0	\$18,930 + HST
LBE Group	73.5	\$43,115 + HST
KGS Group	79.0	\$35,809 + HST
TBT Engineering	67.0	\$33,900 + HST
SISU Mechanical	28.0	\$50,099 + HST *
Saulteaux Consulting	72.5	\$35,750 + HST

* Includes Tendering and Construction costs

Following receipt of the proposals, a review of all documents was completed. A scoring matrix was utilized where the proposals were rated on 5 categories and weighting applied to each was used to judge the proposals. The categories were: quality of proposal, 30% weight, past experience, 30% weight, key personnel, 10% weight, cost, 20% weight, and schedule, 10% weight.

Through this process, one proposal stood out the most. KGS Group submitted a complete proposal with great attention to detail and thorough understand of the project scope. KGS scored well across all 5 matrices while supplying a competitive price of \$35,809 + HST which falls within budget. KGS has a great amount of relevant experience and complete all work in house. In addition, KGS included the most detailed health and safety section and it is reassuring that they make safety a priority.

It should be noted that most firms extended the scope of work to include tendering and construction phases. This was not to be included in the proposals and I have omitted the additional costing from this report except for SISU. SISU did not provide detailed costing therefore I could not breakout the tender and construction costs which is why their cost is significantly higher than the others. RVI Group submitted costing of \$18,930 but I have concerns that they do not fully understand the scope of work and they did not submit a thorough or detailed proposal. RVI did not address several key components of the RFP and I do not feel confident that they would be able to effectively execute this project.

I recommend that the contract for the design work for the HVAC upgrades at the Museum and MSC be awarded to KGS Group.

Respectfully Submitted



Adam Mitchell

Asset Management Coordinator

H:\Public Works\Facilities\Museum\RFP 19-OF-09 Report to Travis.docx