

April 12, 2016

Report To: Mayor and Council

From: Travis Rob, Facilities/Special Projects Coordinator

RE: Award of RFP 16-PD-03 – A Reputable Telecommunications firm for the replacement of the Telephone Systems in 8 Town Facilities.

Background

After a major failure of the primary phone system in the Civic Centre during August of 2015, a review of the current system and options for replacement have been ongoing. A working group consisting of Jason Kabel, Manager of Community Services, Frank Sheppard, Fire Chief, Frank Wepruk, IT Services, and myself as the project lead was established. After a thorough review of the current system was conducted a request for proposals was sent out for the full replacement of the phone systems, including all associated handsets, servers and related infrastructure in the Civic Centre, Public Works, Museum, Daycare Centre, Airport, Water Treatment Plant, Memorial Sports Centre, and Library as these systems are all currently interconnected and of varying age and condition. The request for proposals was sent to 13 area firms specializing in business telecommunication systems on February 18, 2016 as well as advertised in the Fort Frances Times. Further to this there was a mandatory site visit held on March 8, 2016 where there were 5 firms in attendance. Those firms were: NRM Telecom, SmartIP, Telecom Options, Teleco and Bell.

Submissions

On March 29, 2016 the request for proposals closed at 2:00pm in the committee room of the Civic Centre. Four firms submitted proposals, those being Bell (Thunder Bay Office), Telcom Options of Winnipeg Manitoba, Teleco Landline of Thunder Bay, and Smart IP of Winnipeg Manitoba. Each proposal was evaluated against 13 different weighted criteria as outlined below:

1. Cost
2. Functionality of standard equipment & Features to meet our needs
3. Availability of additional capabilities for growth and expansion
4. Ability to save ongoing communication costs
5. Ease of use
6. Product quality, reliability & Warranty plan
7. Vendor Qualifications
8. Service and Support resources including training by vendor
9. Experience with product
10. Certified vendor relationship with product manufacturer
11. References
12. Proposal Quality
13. Schedule

After the initial review was completed, further clarifying questions were posed to the respective firms and references were contacted where it was deemed necessary. The following scores were tabulated

from the available members of the committee. These scores represent the weighted scores of the aspects of the RFP as detailed in the RFP, and are out of a possible 100 marks.

Firm	Travis R	Frank W	Jason K	Average Score
Bell	46.5	65.5	49	53.7
Telcom Options	66	68	69	66
Teleco	66.5	80	70	72.2
SmartIP	56.5	64.5	68	63

A breakdown of each of their proposal costs is included in the table below.

Firm	Implementation Schedule	Cost	Town's Portion HST	Total Cost	5-Year Additional Warranty (cost for 5 year term)
SmartIP	May 1 - August 25	\$ 103,642.23	\$ 1,824.10	\$ 105,466.33	\$ 10,500.00
Bell	N/A	\$ 121,885.42	\$ 2,145.18	\$ 124,030.60	\$ 44,202.00
Telecom Options	April 27 - July 1	\$ 119,084.42	\$ 2,095.89	\$ 121,180.31	\$ 26,160.00
Teleco Landline*	June 1 - July 31	\$ 197,900.00	\$ 3,483.04	\$ 201,383.04	\$ 20,147.40
*Teleco Cost breakdown: Phone - \$124,950.00 + Point to Point - \$72,950.00					

The highlights of the proposal evaluations of each firm are as follows:

Smart IP:

Schedule of implementation would be from early May to August 25. References in Dryden, Sioux Lookout, Kenora, Red Lake and office in Winnipeg. System will utilize existing network system between buildings with existing lines (4 at Civic Centre, 1 at each other site) for backup purposes. Will use existing cisco switches, uninterruptable power supplies (all at or beyond end of life). Unclear on the ability to consolidate lines and save costs. Proposal lacking much of the required information as set out in the RFP document.

Bell:

No implementation schedule included in the proposal. No intent to reduce lines and operating costs. Town to provide detailed network and complete any/all upgrades prior to implementation. Town also to provide Bell: floor plans, internet connection, virtual network environment (not our current system) removal of existing equipment, racking for mounting of new hardware, data cabling to each phone or additional equipment.

Telcom Options:

Implementation schedule from April 27 – July 1, 2016. Utilize the existing data network with Civic Center as the main hub. No clear plan for the consolidation and savings, call out fee \$100.00 plus time and travel. Provided a proposed calling tree. Very aggressive installation and training schedule.

Teleco Landline

As can be seen, Teleco Landline was selected as the preferred supplier. Teleco is the most expensive of the proposals, however they are proposing the installation of a dedicated point to point communications network connecting all sites for a more robust network and providing additional

redundancy for the phone system. Each firm was to review our current network infrastructure and confirm that the network had the capacity available to include voice content as well as the data transmission already in place. Teleco discovered what the working group suspected; that our current network does not have the capacity between all sites to handle voice and data currently. Teleco proposes that the new point to point network may be able to be utilized for data in the future after the implementation of the phone system seeing improved connection between some of the sites currently plagued with slow network speeds. Each firm was to provide a 5 year warranty and maintenance program as part of the proposal as well as costing for extensions to this maintenance program. For Teleco the 5 year maintenance was included with a 5 year extension available for \$20,147.40 which was one of the least expensive options. Another aspect included in the proposal was a review of the current lines under contract with Bell to service the town facilities and propose consolidation and cost savings opportunities by removing lines not needed with a new and more robust system. Teleco anticipates a possible savings of 75% (approximately \$19,000.00 per year) by reducing lines and setting up a better calling tree to provide improved customer service. The firms were to outline their service call times for response and Teleco committed to a 2h call time for a major system failure, which was in alignment with all other firms. Teleco has retained Triple A Contracting, a local telecommunications firm to aid in the installation and also the ongoing warranty service. Triple A have provided services and support to the Town of Fort Frances in the past and have provided very good quality service to the town. The proposed cost did not include the upgrading of any switches, routers or wiring necessary to complete the installation, any additional equipment to facilitate this project will be an additional cost. It should be noted that it is anticipated that all existing wiring will be sufficient for the new system.

Recommendation

The proposal evaluation was discussed at the April 18, 2016 meeting of the Planning and Development Executive Committee and It is the recommendation of the Planning and Development Executive Committee that the contract for the supply and installation of a new phone system and related network infrastructure be awarded to Teleco Landline of Thunder Bay for a total cost of \$197,900.00 plus the Town's portion of HST and further an executing By-Law be prepared.

Respectfully Submitted

A handwritten signature in black ink, appearing to read 'Travis Rob', with a stylized flourish at the end.

Travis Rob, EIT
Chief Building Official
Facilities/Special Projects Coordinator
Interim Municipal Planner

Council Approval of this report will award the contract for contract for the supply and installation of a new phone system and related network infrastructure to Teleco Landline of Thunder Bay for a total cost of \$197,900.00 plus the Town's portion of HST and further an executing By-Law be prepared.
--